



**University of
Zurich**^{UZH}

**Zurich Open Repository and
Archive**

University of Zurich
University Library
Strickhofstrasse 39
CH-8057 Zurich
www.zora.uzh.ch

Year: 1988

**Criticism of Crusading 1095-1274. By Elizabeth Siberry. Pp. xii + 257.
Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1985**

Schmugge, Ludwig

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1017/s0022046900021084>

Posted at the Zurich Open Repository and Archive, University of Zurich

ZORA URL: <https://doi.org/10.5167/uzh-155334>

Journal Article

Published Version

Originally published at:

Schmugge, Ludwig (1988). Criticism of Crusading 1095-1274. By Elizabeth Siberry. Pp. xii + 257. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1985. *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 39(02):297-298.

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1017/s0022046900021084>

SHORT NOTICES

identifying and addressing the grand issues – or, indeed, by his bringing of the one into the service of the other. The collection includes Campbell's wide-ranging essays on the age of the conversion (originally published in the *Ampleforth Journal*), as well as his several studies of Bede, which have done so much to persuade the present generation of historians to respect the *Ecclesiastical History* as a didactic work before exploiting the information which it contains. Among the other items included in the collection are a paper (appearing here for the first time in English) which seeks to characterise the nature of Anglo-Saxon society seen through the earliest law codes, and Campbell's essay on 'The Church in Anglo-Saxon towns', which is an effective antidote to those (mainly Anglo-Saxon monks) who would have us believe that organised monasticism was the most important feature of the pre-Conquest Church. What is so impressive about Campbell's command of the period is, however, that he can match his essays on early Anglo-Saxon social and religious history with studies of late Anglo-Saxon and Anglo-Norman administrative history and, moreover, that he can transform understanding of the English evidence by effective and apposite appeal to the continental parallel. Here we are given Campbell's 'Observations on English government from the tenth to the twelfth century' and his exposition of 'The significance of the Anglo-Norman state in the administrative history of Western Europe', in both of which the workings of royal government and local administration are laid bare and illuminated by reference to the wider context. The range of the collection is extended still further by Campbell's study of 'England, France, Flanders and Germany in the reign of Æthelred the Unready: some comparisons and connections', and by his fascinating examination of 'Some twelfth-century views of the Anglo-Saxon past'. One can only regret that Campbell's essay on 'Asser's *Life of Alfred*' (in *The Inheritance of Historiography 350–900*, ed. C. Holdsworth and T. P. Wiseman, Exeter 1986, pp. 115–35), and his account of 'Some agents and agencies of the late Anglo-Saxon state' (in *Domesday Studies*, ed. J. C. Holt, Woodbridge 1987, pp. 201–18), appeared too late for inclusion.

TRINITY COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

SIMON KEYNES

Criticism of Crusading 1095–1274. By Elizabeth Siberry. Pp. xii + 257. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1985. £25. 0 19 821953 9

The subject of Miss Siberry's book has been in need of scholarly attention ever since the publication in 1940 of Palmer A. Throop's *Criticism of the Crusade*, which was mainly concerned with the late thirteenth and fourteenth centuries. The present study fills a substantial gap and helps us more clearly to understand resistance to the crusade movement. (See also the author's papers on 'Missionaries and Crusades', *Studies in Church History* xx, and 'Criticism of crusading in fourteenth-century England', in *Crusade and Settlement*, ed. P. Edbury, 1985). Starting from J. Riley-Smith's broader definition of crusade (as against that of H. E. Mayer), Miss Siberry reviews most of the scattered sources which testify to increasing criticism of crusading activities especially after 1147. Her thoroughly documented study includes chroniclers, Provençal troubadours and Minnesänger as well as the writings of Roger Bacon. She has gathered much more material than the present reviewer did in the introduction to his edition of Ralph Niger's

De re militari (Berlin 1977), a work of which Miss Siberry makes considerable use.

Although written with only a limited purpose in view, this book is in fact *Fundgrube* for many topics related to crusading: vows and their redemptions, taxation as well as the intellectual climate in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries (especially *ratione peccati* arguments). I do not quite agree with the view that many were anxious to take the Cross against the Staufen (p. 187), or that crusading was still quite popular in 1274 and after. Indeed the ingenious 'invention' of the Roman Holy Year in 1300 and the beginnings of periodic pilgrimage enjoyed the success they did precisely for the reason that crusading enthusiasm had finally faded away. These reservations apart, Miss Siberry's book stands as a major contribution to the history of the Crusades in the Middle Ages.

UNIVERSITY OF ZÜRICH

LUDWIG SCHMUGGE

La Vocazione sacerdotale: i canonici regolari nel Medioevo. By Réginald Grégoire. (La

Spiritualità Cristiana, 7.) Pp. 230. Rome: Edizioni Studium, 1982. L. 26,500 This modest but useful book is the first medieval title to appear in a twenty-volume series which will be concerned with topics in Christian spirituality from the earliest times to the present. A feature of it will be the especially full citation of sources, in Italian translation. Thus, the last quarter of Dom Grégoire's study of the regular canons comprises a translation of *Vita A*, the Life that lays emphasis upon the preaching and itinerant ministry of Norbert of Xanten, founder of the Premonstratensian order of white canons and later archbishop of Magdeburg. The chapters that lead up to it have much to say about the history and antecedents of the regular canons, who found their principal inspiration in the life of the Apostolic Church as set forth in the Acts of the Apostles. There are excellent, if brief, treatments of the place of St Augustine himself and of the legislation of Bishop Chrodegang of Metz and the *Regula canonicorum* of Aachen. But most of the book comprises an analysis of the priestly life during, and in the aftermath of, the Gregorian Reform, when the regular canons adopted customs and rules which (as one of their number expressed it) set them 'as it were in the middle, being unlike those who withdrew from the company of wordly men entirely and unlike those who are called seculars and who share their living quarters with other men'. Dom Grégoire illustrates, with well-chosen excerpts from his sources, what the regular canons did and did not have spiritually in common with the monks. He casts his net widely and is careful not to concentrate unduly on any single school of spirituality, such as that of Saint-Victor. The importance of Pope Gregory VII's *Regula canonica* and of the Rule ascribed to his disciple, Bishop Anselm of Lucca, is emphasised; it is, perhaps, surprising not to hear more of the steps taken by the Cluniac Pope Urban II to give the canons parity of esteem with the monks. But all in all, Dom Grégoire succeeds in giving an original and instructive conspectus of the canons' manner of life, particularly in the age of Norbert of Xanten, as they themselves experienced and presented it. It is good to learn that we can expect from Dom Grégoire a more detailed study of Norbert's *Vita A*, which he rightly describes as 'uno dei più tipici documenti agiografici del XII secolo'.

ST EDMUND HALL,
OXFORD

H. E. J. COWDREY